



**Jointly Held
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees
Meeting Minutes**

October 18, 2022

Members Present: Sharon Howard, Chair
Al Fullenkamp
Sharon Hairston
Adrienne Heard
Belinda Matthews-Stenson
Thomas Weckesser
David P. Williamson

Excused: John A. Lumpkin

Staff in Attendance: Roland Caldwell
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall
Deborah Howard
Pat O'Malley
Brandon Policicchio
Mary Kay Stanforth

Ms. Howard called the meeting to order at 8:35 a.m. and roll call was taken:

Roll Call

Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Mr. Lumpkin -	Excused
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

A quorum was present, and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Approval of September 20, 2022 Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees Meeting Minutes

Ms. Howard asked if attendees request a reading of the minutes or have corrections to the minutes? There were no requests or corrections.

MOTION made by Mr. Fullenkamp and SECONDED by Ms. Hairston to APPROVE the September 20, 2022 Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting minutes.

The Motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

October 2022 Board Action Items

Action Item #2 – Resolution No. 2022-11-1, Fiscal Year 2023 and 2024, 49 United States Code 5307, 5337, 5339 & Other Federal Grants

Ms. Stanforth stated 49 United States Code (USC) 5307 authorizes grants to public transit systems in urbanized areas for capital, operating, and planning assistance based on formulas used in the statute.

49 USC 5337 and 5339 authorizes grants to public transit systems in urbanized areas for capital assistance to support and maintain fixed guideway assets (5337) and other capital assets (5339) in a state of good repair. The Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) can use this funding for the purchase of electric trolley buses, modernization of trolley infrastructure, the capitalization of maintenance costs, and other supporting facilities & equipment projects as well as to maintain capital assets in a state of good repair. These funds are based on formulas used in the statute.

Resolution No. 2022-11-1 provides authorization to file Fiscal Year 2023 and 2024, USC 5307, 5337, 5339 and other Federal Capital Assistance Grants.

The projects applied for will be consistent with RTA approved capital and operating budgets. Prior year funding levels for programs were \$16.93 million for 5307, \$19.54 million for 5337 and \$1.16 million for 5339. 2023 and 2024 annual funding is anticipated to be similar amounts. All projects will be from RTA approved Fiscal Year 2023 and/or 2024 Capital and Operating Budgets.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of Resolution No. 2022-11-1, authorizing the filing of 49 USC 5307, 5337, 5339 and Other Federal Capital Grant Applications for RTA Fiscal Years 2023 and 2024 with the Federal Transit Administration. Furthermore, the Chief Executive Officer is authorized to provide all necessary documents, execute grant contracts, amend the grant contracts if deemed necessary and fulfill all other requirements of the applications.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #3 – Resolution No. 2022-11-2, State Fiscal Years 2024 and 2025 Ohio Urban Public Transportation Grant Program Applications

Ms. Stanforth stated the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT) provides financial assistance to public transportation systems in Ohio through the Ohio Urban Public Transportation Grant Program. Current funding opportunities are offered under the Urban Formula Program and the Preservation Partnership Program. The RTA intends to use state awarded funds for Preventive Maintenance or other Capital Projects based on budget need. Because of the State Fiscal Year (SFY) (July 1 through June 30), eligible projects can be selected from either the RTA's 2023, 2024, or 2025 list of eligible projects.

Historically RTA has applied under the Urban Transit Program, as well as the Ohio Transit Preservation Partnership Program. In addition, we have applied for funding under some Ohio EPA programs, which are open to Ohio public transit systems; other funding opportunities may arise and will be considered for application based on program requirements and current need.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of Resolution No. 2022-11-2, authorizing the filing of various applications for eligible projects under State of Ohio Public Transportation Grant Programs for State Fiscal Years 2024 (July 2023 – June 2024) and 2025 (July 2024 – June 2025).

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #4 – Authorizing Ohio Transit Risk Pool Shock Loss Fund Payments

The RTA is a member of the Ohio Transit Risk Pool (OTRP). OTRP allows members to contribute additional amounts, over and above annual premiums, to a Shock Loss Fund. The Shock Loss Fund provides a set aside for larger, sometimes catastrophic, claims. Statistical averages indicate the pool can expect a larger claim of this magnitude every 3 to 5 years. Each agency’s share of the OTRP Shock Loss Fund is tracked by agency and all investment earnings are credited to each agency on an annual basis while the funds remain invested by OTRP.

Each OTRP member is required to maintain at least one times annual costs to the Shock Loss Fund but may contribute up to a total of six additional times their annual OTRP contribution. OTRP is a public agency and is subject to the same investing and audit requirements as RTA and the other members of the pool.

Greater Dayton RTA insurance expense history and projections:

- 12/19 to 11/20 – March McLennan - \$1.7 M
- 12/20 to 11/21 – Marsh McLennan – \$2.6 M plus \$1.0 M deductibles (2 large claims)
- 12/21 to 11/22 – OTRP – \$1.4 M plus \$915k for initial Shock Loss Fund Requirement
- 12/22 to 11/23 – OTRP - \$1.6 M projection plus \$1.0 M for Shock Loss Fund
- 12/23 to 11/24 – OTRP - \$1.8 M projection plus \$1.0 M for Shock Loss Fund

To continue to provide for future Shock Losses, Staff seeks authority to fund an additional \$1.0 million for OTRP coverage year ending 11/2023 and an additional \$1.0 million for OTRP coverage year ending 11/2024. This will help ensure RTA can absorb any future share of major losses within the pool without an unexpected budget impact. If at any point in the future RTA withdraws from the pool, unused Shock Loss Funds would be returned to RTA by action of the OTRP Board.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Hairston that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of Ohio Transit Risk Pool Shock Loss Fund Payments of \$1.0 million for coverage year ending 11/2023 and \$1.0 million for coverage year ending 11/2024.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #5 – Regional Funding Program

Ms. Stanforth stated the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) allocates federal funds to the Dayton Urbanized Area, which includes three public transit providers who are eligible to use these funds; Miami County Public Transit, Greene CATS, and Greater Dayton RTA. How these funds are distributed between the agencies is a local decision. All three agencies previously agreed to a funding split of the 5307 funds based on a formula very similar to that used by FTA when they allocate funds nationally. This annual process is administered by the Miami Valley Regional Planning Commission (MVRPC) and is not proposed to change.

Greene CATS currently provides regional services which connect to RTA’s system at the Downtown Dayton Transit Center. Miami County Public Transit works to ensure their demand response customers can connect

to RTA routes to improve regional service. All three agencies currently work together in ensuring that public transportation efforts in the counties of Greene, Miami, and Montgomery meet the needs of the riding public. They also work as a team in several FTA areas including; transit enhancements, FTA reviews, technical assistance, regional transit planning, route planning, etc.

With the passage of the federal infrastructure funding bill our region received increased grant funding. For smaller agencies without large capital needs it can be challenging to use these federal funds. If the funds are not placed on a grant within 5 years, they will be lost to the region. To help ensure this does not happen, Greater Dayton RTA proposes the following program, which is very similar to one we administered in 2016.

Greater Dayton RTA shall be authorized to provide local cash to support the transportation efforts of Greene Cats and/or Miami Public Transit upon request by either agency in an amount equal to 70% of available federal funds that have been allocated to them and that they have not yet placed on a grant.

The agency requesting the local cash support will request the federal funds be transferred to Greater Dayton RTA at full 100% value. This will be done via a letter to the MVRPC and FTA and will be signed by the transferring agency and Greater Dayton RTA.

Greater Dayton RTA will then issue a check equal to 70% of the federal funds transferred to the transit agency transferring their federal funds to Greater Dayton RTA.

Greater Dayton RTA will use these transferred funds on current and future FTA applications to support the Greater Dayton RTA Board approved Capital Plan.

This program will be offered through the current federal funding cycle, FFY2022-26 if RTA has available projects where federal funds can be used and available local funding.

RTA previously worked with both organizations on this in 2016 to ensure no regional transit funds were lost and local funds were put to the best use to support public transit in our region. This program will again be offered to both organizations and can be implemented upon the approval of each governing body.

RTA currently has a request from Greene Cats to consider a transfer of their FFY2022 federal funds as they still have funding from prior years available to meet their needs.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees that Greater Dayton RTA make available local transit funds to one or both of our regional partner transit systems and that Greater Dayton RTA accept the transfer of available federal allocation funds from one or both of our transit partners when it works for both parties for the current federal funding cycle FFY2022-26. Furthermore, the RECOMMENDATION permits the Chief Executive Officer to execute all documents necessary to transfer local transit funds and to accept the transfer of regionally available federal funds from one or both of our regional transit partners.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #6 – Fare Media

Ms. Stanforth stated RTA received proposals from qualified firms to provide the following types of Fare Media:

Reloadable Smartcards, which are used by the riding public. They are sold from our Ticket Vending Machines at Wright Stop Plaza and the Transit Centers.

Single-Use Ultralight cards which are sold in bulk to agencies and organizations that purchase transportation for their clients, employees, etc.

Both types of media must be compatible with all Masabi software and equipment currently in use by RTA.

Proposals for Fare Media were solicited through the Dayton Daily News, Dayton Weekly News, and Transit Talent. Requests for Proposals (RFP) were sent to ten (10) firms.

On October 11, 2022, two (2) proposals were received and reviewed by the Evaluation Committee based on the following criteria:

- Prior Experience
- Demonstrated proven experience in providing fare media
- Delivery Timelines
- Delivery within six (6) – eight (8) weeks of order placement is desirable, but twelve (12) weeks would be the maximum
- Reasonableness of Cost
- Proposer shall submit in sufficient detail the cost to address all requirements in the Scope of Work for a three (3) year period plus two (2) option years
- Compatibility with System
- Proposed Fare Media is compatible with Masabi software.

The following firms submitted a proposal:

Masabi, New York, NY
EDM Technology, Inc, High Point, NC*

*EDM Technology, Inc.’s proposal was severely lacking in responses to the Request for Proposal, and after the initial review, they were not given further consideration.

A cost analysis was completed on Masabi’s proposal, and it was determined that their pricing was fair and reasonable as this price represented a little over a 1% increase over RTA’s last purchase.

Mr. Fullenkamp requested an update on the upcoming credit card launch. Mr. Policicchio replied we are on schedule to do the trial phase of the launch this Fall.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Weckesser that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Masabi for Fare Media for three (3) years at an estimated cost of \$577,340.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0

Action Item #7 – Demand Response Transportation Services

Ms. Policicchio explained RTA is seeking to enter into partnership agreements with qualified mobility providers to assist with delivering demand-responsive services to enhance and increase mobile access within the region. RTA has been working with contractors since 1995 to provide Demand Response Transportation Services and this procurement will continue that practice. RTA employed drivers will continue to provide Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (ADA) Paratransit trips unless we have exhausted all voluntary and mandatory work assignment options.

All contractors providing any of RTA’s demand response services will be required to provide transportation to individuals with or without disabilities in accordance with service applicable ADA and other federal regulations. Proposals are for ambulatory and non-ambulatory services. Proposers were able to quote on ambulatory service only, non-ambulatory service only, or both for RTA’s two types of services:

- General Demand Response Services
- ADA Paratransit Services

The selected transportation providers will represent the RTA and must meet safety, performance, and quality measures set by RTA.

Proposals were solicited through the Dayton Daily News, Dayton Weekly News, and Transit Talent. Request for Proposals were sent to 31 providers.

On August 18, 2022, six (6) proposals were received. The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposals to determine the most qualified proposers using the following criteria:

- Requirements outlined within the Scope of Work, background and experience, and personnel Standards and Expectations sections
- Reasonableness of Cost
- References

The following providers submitted a proposal:

Anton’s Cab Service, LLC Dayton, OH
Lyft, Inc. San Francisco, CA
Raiser, LLC (Uber) San Francisco, CA
River North Transit LLC (Via) New York, NY
Spare Labs Inc. Vancouver, BC
Uzurv Holdings, Inc. Richmond, VA

The pricing received is included in today’s meeting packet.

A cost analysis was performed, which took into consideration all the various components the different vendors proposed. This analysis revealed that each ADA Paratransit trip ranged from \$29.43 to \$34.33 based on

average mileage of 8.55 miles. Each General Demand Response trip ranged from \$10.00 to \$13.26 based on average mileage of 3 miles.

Demand Response Transportation Service providers will be paid with either unrestricted or restricted local operating funds, or transportation related capital funds based on the service provided, at an estimated budget of \$2,400,000 per year.

MOTION made by Ms. Howard and SECONDED by Ms. Hairston that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees contract AWARDS to Anton's Cab Service LLC, Raiser, LLC (Uber), Lyft, Inc., and Uzurv Holdings, Inc. for a total estimated award not to exceed \$2,400,000 per year or \$7,200,000 for three years, plus \$2,400,000 for Option Year 1 and \$2,400,000 for Option Year 2, for a grand total of \$12,000,000. Funds will be divided as needed between the providers based on agency or customer choice, where applicable. In addition, the MOTION AUTHORIZES the Chief Executive Officer to carry out all actions necessary to add additional qualified providers as needed throughout the contract period.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0

Customer and Business Development Update

Mr. Policicchio stated the Customer and Business Development Department update was provided in today's meeting packet.

- RTA held its second Interactive Hiring Event on Tuesday, September 27 at the University of Dayton Arena. Participation more than doubled that of the first Event held in June. Most attendees indicated they came to the event specifically looking for work. Attendees wanted to be able to try out the bus and see if they could handle driving it. The RTA team used this as a way to indicate that RTA will provide on-the-job, CDL training.
- Three employees were recognized at the Customer and Business Development quarterly meeting held September 14. Graphic Designer Carmen Gaines was recognized for going above and beyond by helping a customer who had a medical emergency on the bus platform. Customer Service Coordinator Paul Hamm received a commendation for helping a woman who was stuck on the road when a vehicle broke down. Customer Service Supervisor Mark Stankiewicz received recognition for 10 years of service at RTA.
- RTA drivers show team spirit by wearing NFL jerseys on Saturdays and Sundays.
- For the month of October the RTA is going pink, or at least its October bus design is, for Breast Cancer Awareness month. The pink design includes spooky touches such as jack-o-lanterns, bats, and spiders as a nod to Halloween.

Mr. Policicchio made a presentation which included highlights of RTA's ridership to date, and a comparison to the rest of the United States. He noted RTA is beginning to trend better than the U.S. average, and that weekend ridership continues to rise. Mr. Policicchio provided information on RTA's current workforce challenges, and the need to ensure that workforce levels meet the scheduled service on the street. Finally, he discussed there would be two upcoming service changes, one minor in November, and a major service change in January/February 2023.

Small Purchasing Information

Ms. Howard stated the Small Purchasing Information was included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions regarding small purchases.

Next Meetings

The upcoming jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meetings will be held on November 15 and December 20, 2022.

Adjournment

Hearing no objections, Ms. Howard declared the meeting ADJOURNED at approximately 10:00 a.m.

ATTEST



Sharon Howard, Chair



Mary K. Stanforth, Committee Secretary