



**Jointly Held  
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees  
Meeting Minutes**

**October 22, 2024**

**Members Present:** Sharon D. White, Chair  
Ashton Dupler  
Al Fullenkamp  
John A. Lumpkin, Jr.  
Belinda Matthews-Stenson (arrived 8:32 a.m.)  
Nikol Miller  
Grady Mullins  
David P. Williamson

**Excused:** Thomas Weckesser

**Staff in Attendance:** Bob Ruzinsky  
Daron Brown  
Roland Caldwell  
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall  
Deborah Howard  
Shanel Kilgore  
Brandon Policicchio  
Shawn Prince  
Alex Smith  
Mary K. Stanforth

Ms. White called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. and roll call was taken:

**Roll Call**

Ms. White -	Yes
Mr. Dupler -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Mr. Lumpkin	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Excused
Ms. Miller -	Yes
Mr. Mullins -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Excused
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

A quorum was present, and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

**Approval of September 17, 2024, Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees Meeting Minutes**

Ms. White asked if attendees request a reading of the minutes or have corrections to the minutes?

Upon hearing no requests or corrections, a MOTION was made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin to APPROVE the September 17, 2024 minutes.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Ms. Matthews-Stenson arrived at the meeting at 8:32 a.m.

**November 2024 Board Action Items**

**Action Item #2 – 2025 Operating and Capital Budgets**

Mr. Ruzinsky made a detailed presentation regarding Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority's (RTA) proposed 2025 Operating and Capital Budgets. RTA's total Operating Revenues for 2025 are projected at \$84.4 million while total Operating Expenses are projected at \$84.2 million. This budget scenario reflects a gain of \$164 thousand before local capital charges and a loss of \$3.7 million after local capital charges.

Passenger fares represent 8% of projected operating revenues, while sales tax represents 59%, federal and state assistance equal 28%, and investment income and other equal 5%. Regarding operating expenses, wages and fringe benefits are 68% of the projected total, contract services are 9%, materials and supplies (which includes fuel) are 9%, and insurance, utilities and all other are 14%. The 2025 operating budget includes funds for "full employment" levels along with contract wage increases, increased health insurance and other benefit costs.

Regarding the Capital Budget, expenditures for 2025 are projected at \$56.3 million with \$26.7 million funded by RTA. Pandemic funds held in reserve are included in RTA's funding amount. Capital projects include the categories: Electric System Infrastructure, Revenue Vehicles & Equipment, Transit Hubs & Facility Improvements and Equipment, Technology, Amenities & Other. All projects must follow FTA procurement rules and be approved by the Board of Trustees (for individual projects over \$100 thousand) or the Chief Executive Officer (for projects under \$100 thousand). This ensures the Board has a second level of approval, in addition to approving the overall Capital Budget each year.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of the 2025 Operating and Capital Budgets. This APPROVAL allows the Secretary-Treasurer to file the appropriate documents with the Montgomery County Auditor and to receive a certificate authorizing 2025 expenditures.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

**Action Item #3 – Resolution No. 2024-11-1, Fiscal Year (FY) 2025 Annual Appropriations**

Ms. Stanforth stated the Board of Trustees' adoption of the FY 2025 Operating and Capital Budgets will establish budget limits for the upcoming year. Trustees' approval of Resolution No. 2024-11-1 will appropriate the needed funds to conduct the activities approved in the Budget documents.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Fullenkamp that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of Resolution No. 2024-11-1, Fiscal Year 2025 Annual Appropriations.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

**Action Item #4 – Resolution No. 2024-11-2, Fiscal Years 2025 and 2026, 49 United States Code 5307, 5337, 5339 & Other Federal Capital Assistance Grants**

Mr. Ruzinsky stated 49 United States Code (USC) 5307 authorizes grants to public transit systems in urbanized areas for capital, operating, and planning assistance based on formulas used in the statute.

49 USC 5337 and 5339 authorizes grants to public transit systems in urbanized areas for capital assistance to support and maintain fixed guideway assets (5337) and other capital assets (5339) in a state of good repair. RTA can use this funding for the purchase of electric trolley buses, modernization of trolley infrastructure, the capitalization of maintenance costs, and other supporting facilities & equipment projects as well as to maintain capital assets in a state of good repair. These funds are based on formulas used in the statute.

Resolution No. 2024-11-2 provides authorization to file Fiscal Years 2025 and 2026, USC 5307, 5337, 5339 and other Federal Capital Assistance Grants.

The projects applied for will be consistent with RTA approved capital and operating budgets. Prior year funding levels for programs were \$17.73 million for 5307, \$20.21 million for 5337 and \$1.01 million for 5339. 2025 and 2026 annual funding is anticipated to be similar amounts. All projects will be from RTA approved Fiscal Year 2025 and/or 2026 Capital and Operating Budgets.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Miller that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of Resolution No. 2024-11-2, authorizing the filing of 49 USC 5307, 5337, 5339 and Other Federal Capital Grant Applications for RTA Fiscal Years 2025 and 2026 with the Federal Transit Administration. Furthermore, the Chief Executive Officer is authorized to provide all necessary documents, execute grant contracts, amend the grant contracts if deemed necessary and fulfill all other requirements of the applications.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

**Action Item #5 – Resolution No. 2024-11-3, State Fiscal Years 2026 & 2027 Ohio Urban Public Transportation Grant Program Applications**

Mr. Ruzinsky stated the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT) provides financial assistance to public transportation systems in Ohio through the Ohio Urban Public Transportation Grant Program. Current funding opportunities are offered under the Urban Formula Program and the Preservation Partnership Program. RTA intends to use state awarded funds for Preventive Maintenance or other Capital Projects based on budget need. Because of the State Fiscal Year (SFY) (July 1 through June 30), eligible projects can be selected from either the RTA's 2025, 2026, or 2027 list of eligible projects.

Historically RTA has applied under the Urban Transit Program, as well as the Ohio Transit Preservation Partnership Program. In addition, we have applied for funding under some Ohio EPA programs, which are open to Ohio public transit systems; other funding opportunities may arise and will be considered for application based on program requirements and current need.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of Resolution No. 2024-11-3, authorizing the filing of various applications for eligible projects under State of Ohio Public Transportation Grant Programs for State Fiscal Years 2026 (July 2025 – June 2026) and 2027 (July 2026 – June 2027).

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

**Action Item #6 – Wireless Phone & Data Services & Data Service for Vehicles Change Order**

Mr. Prince stated in January of 2021, the Board of Trustees approved the above-named project with AT&T. The purpose of this action item is to execute a change order for that contract. Changes in technology on the buses have steadily increased the amount of data going between the vehicles and RTA’s network. This includes video, audio files, general data and soon more dynamic live maps.

The current agreement foresaw no overages on the limited data plans, and as such it was based on an annual spend of less than \$60,000 per year for the vehicle portion of the agreement. Based on current data use, the standard rate plus the overage fees are on track to exceed \$200,000 in an annual term, not including other devices.

To mitigate further overage costs, in September 2024, RTA moved all vehicle data plans from the current data limited plans to unlimited plans. This entailed swapping all associated SIMs (cellular ID cards) in the vehicles to which AT&T is including services to perform the physical changes. This put all devices including cell phones, tablets, MiFi hotspots, vehicles, etc., onto a single service plan, all with fixed rates at \$36 per month, negotiated down from \$40, per device, with uncapped, unlimited data. The estimated cost based on current vehicles would move RTA to a fixed annual spend of approximately \$118,000.

With the overage costs and recent change in data plans, this year’s spend is expected to be \$148,386 for vehicles and \$33,425 for devices totaling \$181,811. After reviewing the full contract, an increase to the awarded amount is necessary to cover the overages and the renegotiated data plan. The requested award increase can be seen below:

Total Change Order Award	AT&T Wireless Cincinnati, OH
Current Contract Total	\$ 514,556
Requested Increase	\$ 113,839
New Grand Total not to Exceed	\$ 628,395

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of a contract change to AT&T Wireless for \$113,839 to cover current overage costs plus the new rates for the remainder of the Wireless Phone & Data Services & Data Service for Vehicles contract.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

**Action Item #7 – Surveyor Services**

Mr. Smith stated the purpose of this procurement is to award a five (5) year contract for professional surveying, engineering and related services to support various projects contemplated by RTA. This includes a multi-million-dollar investment in improvements and upgrades to the electrical infrastructure and facilities over a five-year planning window.

A qualification-based procurement method was used where evaluation criteria other than price is used to determine the most qualified firm(s). After the top firms were selected by the evaluation team, pricing was requested.

Once RTA identifies a project, the Surveying firms under contract will be requested to submit a proposal for said project. Proposal pricing can either be based on hourly rates or a single fixed cost for the project. The firm determined to be in RTA’s best interest will be selected. RTA will retain the right not to use the firm under contract if an agreement on the proposal cannot be reached.

Proposals for Surveyor Services were solicited in Dayton Daily News, Dayton Weekly News, and Transit Talent. Requests for Proposals were sent to 92 firms.

At 10:00 a.m., on August 29, 2024, three (3) proposals were received. The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposals to determine the most qualified using the following criteria:

- Understanding of the Scope of Work and RTA’s needs
- Experience with Similar Projects
- Skills and Relevant Affiliations
- Capacity and Job Readiness for Project Turnaround
- Financial and Technical Capability
- References
- Quality of Proposal Preparation

The following firms submitted proposals:

Firm	Location
Environmental Design Group	Akron, OH
Brumbaugh Engineering & Surveying	West Milton, OH
MS Consultants	Moon Township, OH

The two (2) firms ranked the highest by the Evaluation Committee were Environmental Design Group and Brumbaugh Engineering & Surveying. The hourly fee structure proposed by the recommended firms are as follows.

Brumbaugh Engineering & Surveying – Hourly Rates					
Classification	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
Principal / Owner	\$ 155	\$ 160	\$ 164	\$ 169	\$ 174
Project Engineer / Surveyor	\$ 136	\$ 140	\$ 144	\$ 149	\$ 153
Survey/Engineering/CAD Technician	\$ 119	\$ 123	\$ 126	\$ 130	\$ 134
Survey Crew (2 People)	\$ 173	\$ 178	\$ 184	\$ 189	\$ 195
Survey Crew (1 Person)	\$ 132	\$ 136	\$ 140	\$ 144	\$ 149
Administration / Clerical Support	\$ 74	\$ 76	\$ 79	\$ 81	\$ 83

Environmental Design Group – Hourly Rates					
Position	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
Office / Department Manager	\$ 240	\$ 248	\$ 256	\$ 264	\$ 272
Senior Project Manager	\$ 219	\$ 226	\$ 233	\$ 241	\$ 248
Project Manager	\$ 185	\$ 191	\$ 197	\$ 203	\$ 210

Senior Surveyor	\$ 166	\$ 171	\$ 177	\$ 182	\$ 188
Staff Surveyor	\$ 135	\$ 139	\$ 144	\$ 148	\$ 153
Survey Crew (1 Person)	\$ 152	\$ 157	\$ 162	\$ 167	\$ 172
Survey Crew (2 People)	\$ 203	\$ 209	\$ 216	\$ 223	\$ 230
Junior Field / Office Support	\$ 85	\$ 88	\$ 91	\$ 93	\$ 96
Senior Civil Engineer / Surveyor	\$ 180	\$ 186	\$ 192	\$ 198	\$ 204
Civil Engineer 1	\$ 130	\$ 134	\$ 138	\$ 143	\$ 147
Office Technician	\$ 105	\$ 108	\$ 112	\$ 115	\$ 119
Planner	\$ 225	\$ 232	\$ 240	\$ 247	\$ 255
Admin / Clerical Support	\$ 86	\$ 89	\$ 92	\$ 94	\$ 98
Subcontractor: MAJ Consulting – Hourly Rates					
Project Manager	\$ 150	\$ 155	\$ 160	\$ 165	\$ 170
Admin Assistant	\$ 50	\$ 52	\$ 53	\$ 55	\$ 57
Land / Title Researcher	\$ 50	\$ 52	\$ 53	\$ 55	\$ 57
Sr. Right of Way Agent	\$ 110	\$ 114	\$ 117	\$ 121	\$ 125
Drone Operator	\$ 450	\$ 464	\$ 479	\$ 494	\$ 510
Subcontractor: Geopro Consultants – Hourly Rates					
Principal	\$ 204	\$ 211	\$ 217	\$ 224	\$ 231
Project Manager	\$ 172	\$ 177	\$ 183	\$ 189	\$ 195
Professional Surveyor	\$ 136	\$ 140	\$ 145	\$ 149	\$ 154
Crew Chief	\$ 120	\$ 124	\$ 128	\$ 132	\$ 136
Survey Technician	\$ 78	\$ 80	\$ 83	\$ 86	\$ 88
Survey Crew (2 People)	\$ 199	\$ 205	\$ 212	\$ 219	\$ 226
UAS Crew - LIDAR	\$ 405	\$ 418	\$ 431	\$ 445	\$ 459
UAS Crew - Photogrammetry	\$ 325	\$ 335	\$ 346	\$ 357	\$ 368
Photogrammetrist	\$ 104	\$ 107	\$ 111	\$ 114	\$ 118
GIS Analyst	\$ 78	\$ 80	\$ 83	\$ 86	\$ 88
Clerical	\$ 68	\$ 70	\$ 72	\$ 75	\$ 77

Reimbursable supplies and expenses are to be billed at direct cost with no mark up. Mileage will be billed at the current GAO/IRS rate.

A cost analysis was conducted which considered previous rates paid by RTA and regional averages. The hourly rates provided to RTA were found to be fair and reasonable. This contract will be funded with operating and capital funds if services are part of a larger capital project.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Fullenkamp that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees five (5) year contract AWARDS to Brumbaugh Engineering & Surveying and Environmental Design Group for the hourly rates listed above for a total amount of \$350,000 for Surveyor Services.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 6-1-1. Ms. Matthews-Stenson abstained from the vote.

**Action Item #8 – Approval of Title VI Program**

Mr. Policicchio explained RTA is a recipient of U.S. Department of Transportation (USDOT), and Federal Transit Administration (FTA) funding, and therefore must comply with Title VI and Environmental Justice

regulations. This is to ensure RTA provides fair and equitable service and amenities delivery and installation, meaningful customer outreach plans, and periodic service equity review processes.

While the RTA is in compliance with the FTA Title VI program through November 30, 2024 it is required that the Board review and approve the Title VI Program, and supporting service and fare equity reviews since the last submission October, 2021.

Mr. Policicchio requests Board of Trustee approval to submit RTA's Title VI Program.

MOTION made by Mr. Lumpkin and SECONDED by Ms. White that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of the 2024 Title VI Program including the supporting service and fare equity reviews since the last submittal during the third quarter of 2021.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

**Action Item #9 – Record Retention Policy Update**

Mr. Policicchio explained the purpose of this action item is to create an agency-wide record retention policy. The policy will regulate record retention and disposal in accordance with record retention schedules developed by the Ohio Department of Administrative Services for general business functions of a government agency and Federal Transit Administration retention requirements.

The record retention schedules serve as a procedure for managing RTA records. It specifies the minimum length of time each type of record should be retained and outlines what should happen once the retention period has been met.

MOTION made by Mr. Lumpkin and SECONDED by Ms. Miller that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of the Customer and Business Development, Record Retention Policy #9.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

**Action Item #10 – Public Records Policy Update**

Mr. Policicchio explained the purpose of this action item is to update RTA's public records policy. The policy is being updated to align with current Ohio Law.

MOTION made by Mr. Lumpkin and SECONDED by Ms. Matthews-Stenson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of Human Resources, Public Records Policy #1.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

**Action Item #11 – Masabi Contract Renewal**

Mr. Policicchio stated RTA intends to renew, and add to its current fare payment system, Tapp Pay. RTA's current fare payment system provider is Masabi. Masabi was awarded a five-year contract in May 2019, for a grand total of \$2,377,612. To date, RTA has remained under budget and has achieved its original commitment to spending no more than 7% of all passenger fare revenues collected on the management of the fare collection system, and this will be possible again, under the proposed renewal with Masabi.

Since its implementation of Tapp Pay, RTA has found the Masabi system to be reliable, and has met the agency’s goals of (1) providing an open and nonproprietary architecture; (2) enhancing ease of use for customer convenience through universal design, ensuring all customers have the ability to access; (3) increase operational efficiencies; (4) providing a seamless integration with Transit to allow fare purchasing in the app; (5) phasing out and ultimately eliminating on-board cash transactions. In addition, the system design has delivered increased access to all, including low-income, unbanked, and underbanked customers, reduced fare collection costs reductions, provided more streamlined operating processes, and greater customer and operational efficiencies.

RTA’s contract renewal includes the addition of cEMV. cEMV is payment technology that uses near field communication to allow customers to make payments without inserting or swiping a debit/credit card and allows for the usage of a smartphone to pay with Apple or Google Pay. cEMV technology is designed to make payments more secure and facilitate the payment process faster. Customers utilizing cEMV will receive the benefit of fare capping, providing the lowest daily or monthly fare.

RTA conducted a fare survey earlier this year, and 60% of customers surveyed utilize a debit or credit card, and of those customers over 40% indicated interest in utilizing their debit or credit card to pay fare. Not only would this offer a more secure and convenient way to pay, but it would assist in the reduction of costs associated with the management, distribution, and material costs of smartcards.

Masabi’s current contract includes the installation and implementation of the on-board fare payment readers and ticket-vending machines, for which this renewal contract does not include. RTA anticipates that the payment readers, and some ticket-vending machines will likely be upgraded within the span of this new five-year agreement. In addition, RTA anticipates potential fare integration costs with its demand response system to fully integrate services.

A detailed breakdown of Masabi’s pricing is as follows:

<b>Initial cEMV Costs</b>	
Deployment Services	\$35,200
Integrations	\$10,170
PCI Compliance for Hardware	\$19,620
<b>TOTAL Initial Costs</b>	<b>\$64,990</b>

<b>Ongoing &amp; Variable Costs</b>	<b>Year 1</b>	<b>Year 2</b>	<b>Year 3</b>	<b>Year 4</b>	<b>Year 5</b>
Revenue Share	\$328,000	\$346,800	\$366,612	\$387,489	\$409,486
Main Platform Support Fees	\$54,000	\$55,620	\$57,289	\$59,007	\$60,777
TVM Integration Fees	\$18,000	\$18,540	\$19,096	\$19,669	\$20,259
TVM Support Fees	\$12,000	\$12,360	\$12,731	\$13,113	\$13,506
cEMV Maintenance & Support Fees	\$36,000	\$37,080	\$38,192	\$39,338	\$40,518
<b>(1) TOTAL Ongoing &amp; Variable Costs</b>	<b>\$448,000</b>	<b>\$470,400</b>	<b>\$493,920</b>	<b>\$518,616</b>	<b>\$544,547</b>
<b>TOTAL Initial, Ongoing &amp; Variable Costs (Years 1-5)</b>				<b>\$2,540,473</b>	

(1) Actual ongoing and variable costs will depend on the account-based passenger fares sold. Masabi’s revenue share of Commission (2.8%) and Processing Fees (4.7%), and retail outlet processing fees of 8.8% apply only to account-based fare revenues received.



A cost analysis was performed which compared the proposals' software, implementation, and warranty costs, as well as revenue sharing, mobile transaction processing, and retail transaction processing costs, and Masabi's pricing was found to be fair and reasonable.

MOTION made by Mr. Lumpkin and SECONDED by Ms. Matthews-Stenson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Masabi, LLC for an estimated grand total not to exceed \$2,540,473. Initial cEMV costs are fixed. Actual ongoing and variable costs will depend on the fares sold.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 8-0.

**Customer and Business Development Updates**

Mr. Policicchio stated the Customer and Business Development Department updates are included in today's meeting packet.

**August 2024 Financial Report**

Ms. Stanforth stated the August 2024 Financial Report was provided in today's meeting packet. Total revenues are \$190 thousand over budget as a result of higher passenger fares and sales tax, offset by lower federal assistance. Total expenses are \$2.5 million under budget as a result of lower fringe benefits, services, materials & supplies and miscellaneous expense, offset by higher purchased transportation. RTA's service loss is \$672 thousand after eight months, which compares to a budgeted loss of \$3.7 million. The overall financial result is tracking favorably compared to budget.

**Small Purchasing Information**

Ms. Howard stated the Small Purchasing Information was included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions regarding small purchases.

**Next Meeting**

The upcoming jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committee meeting is scheduled for November 19, 2024.

**Adjournment**

Ms. White DECLARED the meeting ADJOURNED at 9:40 a.m.

ATTEST



Sharon D. White, Chair



Mary Kay Stanforth, Committee Secretary